

YALE DIVINITY SCHOOL LIBRARY
Occasional Publication No. 26

**To be Agents of a Life-giving Transformation:
Christian Higher Education in Africa**

by
Joel A. Carpenter

Response

by
Andrew F. Walls

NEW HAVEN, CONNECTICUT
June 2019

The Occasional Publications series is produced by the Yale Divinity Library. This Day Lecture was delivered by Dr. Joel A. Carpenter on June 28, 2019 during the annual meeting of the Yale-Edinburgh Group on the History of the Missionary Movement and World Christianity. A Response was given by Dr. Andrew F. Walls. Both talks are included in this publication. The theme of the 2019 meeting was “Diversity and Difference in Custom, Belief, and Practice in the History of Missions and World Christianity.”

Joel Carpenter is a professor of history and provost, emeritus, of Calvin University. Until recently he was the director of Calvin's Nagel Institute for the Study of World Christianity. Dr. Carpenter has published extensively in the field of American religious history, most notably *Revive Us Again: The Reawakening of American Fundamentalism* (Oxford, 1997). More recently he has been studying Christian movements in the global South and East. He has edited or co-edited five books in this field, most recently *Christianity in India: Conversion, Community Development, and Religious Freedom* (Fortress Press, 2018).

Andrew Walls is Honorary Professor at the University of Edinburgh, Professor of the History of Mission at Liverpool Hope University, and Emeritus Professor at the Akrofi-Christaller Institute for Theology, Mission and Culture. Akropong, Ghana. He is also a co-founder of the Yale Edinburgh Group on the History of the Missionary Movement and World Christianity.

Day Lecture

Dr. Joel A. Carpenter

June 28, 2019

What an honor and delight it is to address this assembly of the Yale-Edinburgh Group. Our meeting comes at a remarkable juncture in the life of this network and movement, so I hope you don't mind if I offer a few personal remarks. As you probably know, my first formation as a professional historian was in American cultural and religious history, and while for the past quarter-century I have become much more interested in the history of world Christianity, I have always felt more like a guest and supporter in these meetings than a front-line agent.

Indeed, without the encouragement of two of the pillars of the Yale-Edinburgh connection, Brian Stanley and our late colleague, Lamin Sanneh, I would not even have the topic I am presenting today. About twenty years ago, when Brian was directing the Currents in World Christianity initiative at Cambridge, he invited me to present a paper at the CWC's concluding conference, to be hosted by the University of Pretoria. I was three years into my work as provost at Calvin College, a busy if not beset college executive. Much as I loved the study of world Christianity, I was not currently researching a topic. But I dearly wanted to go to the South Africa meeting, so I told Brian that I could work up a paper. I said that I wanted to write on the rise of new Christian universities in the Majority World.

An Odd Topic

Now wasn't that an odd topic? How in the world did I land on it? First off, my whole career has been devoted to promoting Christian intellectual life, first in the U.S. and then in other parts of the world. Second, as an executive at a small Christian university, people assumed that I had something to say about Christian higher education, so I had begun giving talks and writing essays about it.¹

But the most compelling driver for engaging this field was my experience of receiving one academic visitor after another from such places as Papua-New Guinea, Indonesia, South Korea, the Dominican Republic, Brazil, Kenya, Nigeria, the Democratic Republic of Congo, Russia, and Lithuania. Each of them told me that they felt called to found a new Christian university. What was going on, and why was it happening just then? I had to find out. So I made a few research escapes from the provost's office and began a remarkable journey of discovery and eventually a team research project. It resulted in the book that our team published five years ago, *Christian Higher Education: A Global Reconnaissance*.²

That project was a tremendous education, and I was glad to have completed it—or so I thought. But then my dear friend and frequent collaborator, Lamin Sanneh, asked me to contribute an article on the history of African Christian higher education to one of his projects, an Oxford handbook on Christianity in Africa. So once again, I stole time from administrative duties, now at the Nagel Institute. What you are hearing today is my offering to my dear friend

and fishing buddy, Lamin, who as you may recall, spent his early career days at Fourah Bay College and then the University of Ghana.

Throughout his career, Lamin fed his voracious curiosity from many directions at once, and this talk traces one of those lines that he had in the water. Lamin's interest was more than mere curiosity. He hoped to see Christian thinking flourish within the institutions of higher learning in Africa. I share those hopes, so in addition to finding out what is happening in African Christian higher education, I want to ask deeper questions about what these institutions should be doing--or in theological terms, what does the Lord require of them? I have been working at this larger question my entire academic life, and those who instruct me are too numerous to name. But one in particular has haunted me with his approach in recent years, our venerable commentator today, Andrew Walls.

Now to begin.

Ancient Origins, Colonial Developments

Christian higher education exists to foster Christian thinking, but that vocation arose on the African continent long before any modern institutions. Prominent early theologians of the church—Athanasius, Augustine, Cyprian, Cyril, Origen, and Tertullian --were North Africans, from Egypt and Carthage. As Tom Oden made us rediscover, African Christian scholars invented theology and analytical interpretation of the Bible, they translated the Old and New Testaments into vernacular languages, and they founded monastic communities which cultivated scholarship.³ Both Egypt and Ethiopia were transformed by this early wave of Christian thinking and learning. For these reasons, argues the Malawian historian, Paul Zeleza, Christianity was one of three early sources for higher education in Africa, along with the Alexandria Library and Museum of Ptolemaic Egypt and Al-Azhar, the great Islamic university in Cairo (f. 972).⁴

South of the Sahara, Christian higher learning has a much more recent history. It began as a feature of European colonial regimes across the continent and within the settlements of freed slaves in Liberia and Sierra Leone. The first modern colleges and universities in Sub-Saharan Africa took root at Fourah Bay College (1827) in Freetown, Sierra Leone, South African College (1829) in Cape Town, and Liberia College (1863), in Monrovia. These early institutions included theology and were staffed to a large extent by missionaries. In the case of the college at the Cape, the instructors were Europeans, but in Sierra Leone and Liberia, they were also West Africans and African-American missionaries.⁵ These early colleges were modeled after British and American centers of learning, which in the nineteenth century were often church-founded and tasked to serve broadly Christian purposes.⁶ Indeed, when agents of Fourah Bay College went searching for a university partner in England to certify their coursework and degrees, they chose the University of Durham, which had arisen from a cathedral college and was founded on a Christian basis. Fourah Bay and Liberia College were for many decades unique and forward-looking agents of local empowerment, built on the assumption that West African students could and should attain learning that met the same standards as their English sponsors. The idea that Western learning was central and normative was of course an

imperialistic presumption, but beyond it the missionaries argued something quite radical at the time: that West African students had the capacity and commitment to attain such an education. In making their case, the sponsors of Fourah Bay and Liberia colleges prevailed against racially prejudiced opponents whose views are too rank to repeat.⁷

In more frankly colonial African settings, educational institutions were designed to serve colonial purposes. Where there very few white settlers, there were in most cases no universities until shortly before independence. Colonial regimes designed native educational systems merely to meet their needs for primary school teachers, farmers and government functionaries. By the 1940s, however, British colonies had begun to establish more collegiate institutions, such as University College Ibadan, Khartoum University College, the University College at Achimota, Gold Coast (now Ghana), and Makerere University College in Kampala. By the 1950s, French and Belgian colonies had followed suit.⁸

In heavily colonized southern Africa, settlers established a remarkable array of universities. In addition to South African College (later the University of Cape Town), settlers founded Stellenbosch University in 1881, the University of Witwatersrand in 1896, the University of the Free State, Rhodes University, and the University of Pretoria in 1904, then the University of Natal in 1910. These institutions were for white students only, and they became part of the grand national plan to unify the white settler nation after the South African War.⁹ The first institutions to educate southern African black people were missionary-founded, notably Lovedale Institute (f. 1841), established for technical, agricultural and teacher training, and South African Native College (f. 1916, later University of Fort Hare) for university-level studies.¹⁰ Fort Hare, said Nelson Mandela in his memoir, “was a beacon for African scholars from all over Southern Central and Eastern Africa.”¹¹ It was also very much a Christian institution, with a Western educational agenda, aiming at forming a Christian professional elite for the region’s black communities. Along the way, however, Fort Hare became a hotbed of protest against the region’s injustices. The university attracted a very gifted student body; among its alumni were the first presidents of Botswana, Tanzania, and Zambia, and the first black presidents of Zimbabwe and South Africa.¹²

New Beginnings, Church and State

Since independence, the main higher education story across sub-Saharan Africa has been the development of state universities, largely under a secular rubric. In the early 1960s, as new African nations were emerging, higher education was virtually nonexistent in many places. There were only 41 institutions and 16,500 students in all of Africa. The new nations founded flagship institutions in the 1960s and early 1970s under the banner of nation-building, in an atmosphere of new beginnings and high hopes, with supportive governments and massive international investment in the form of foreign aid, philanthropy, North-South inter-university collaboration and co-accreditation, and scholarships for undergraduate exchanges and postgraduate professional development.¹³

For the rising churches of sub-Saharan Africa, however, the more immediate need was to build pastoral training institutes and degree-granting theological schools. This enterprise has never kept up with the continent's explosive church growth. In 1900 there were only about 8.5 million Christians in Africa, most of them in Ethiopia and Egypt. By 1950, this number had tripled, to about 30 million. By 1970 there were some 113 million Christians in Africa. Today estimates show nearly 619 million African Christians.¹⁴

This volatile growth has created a chronic shortage of educated clergy. The renowned British mission scholar and ecumenical pioneer, Bishop Stephen Neill, toured East and West Africa in 1950, tasked by the International Missionary Council to survey the state of African theological education. He found only 70 or 80 such institutions.¹⁵ By the mid-1970s, however, there were about 350 theological schools in Africa.¹⁶ Today the most comprehensive directory lists 1467 institutions.¹⁷ These serve not only the older Orthodox, Catholic and Protestant denominations, but the very numerous African instituted and Pentecostal churches as well. The Pentecostal ministerial training scene in particular is quite fluid and dynamic, with new pastoral and lay training institutes springing up across the continent, many of them founded by urban mega-churches and operated on the premises.¹⁸

Seminaries, Bible colleges, and training institutes, however, are not the only places where Christian theology is studied. Universities in some African nations have faculties of theology, most notably in South Africa's state universities and in a number of Francophone nations' Catholic universities. Other state universities, especially in Anglophone Africa, have faculties of religious studies. Unlike their counterparts in the United States, however, these departments frequently include courses in Christian theology, native religious worldviews and practice, or Islamic law, all taught from within these traditions. Thus the website of the University of Ghana's religion department states that it "is dedicated to the promotion of the scientific study of religions but also continues with the promotion of high quality theological education for a just, peaceful and humane society."¹⁹ While these university courses began as training for teachers of religion in the schools, in some universities the majority of the degree students in the "Christian Studies" tracks are Pentecostal pastors.²⁰

Theological seminaries and Bible colleges typically operate under straitened circumstances. Even with rapid church growth, they have to make their way in cash-poor denominations and serve students who cannot bear much of the operating costs. Sponsoring churches need to increase their educated clergy but have very limited means to support increased enrollments. So most of these institutions have remained small and are unable to benefit from economies of scale. Student-faculty ratios of only 5 or 6 to 1 are not uncommon, even while the faculty members might need to teach five or six subjects per term to cover the curriculum. In Francophone Africa, Protestant theological institutions tend to be even less well equipped than in Anglophone settings. A survey of these schools in 2011 revealed that "unlike the Catholic institutions, the Protestant ones are marked by abject poverty in key domains: infrastructures, academic staff, libraries, research and publication."²¹

Theological libraries have been chronically undersupplied. A study published in 1990 found that the average sized theological library had fewer than 5,000 volumes, while only 2 percent of the continent's theological libraries held 15,000 volumes or more.²² A great deal of attention has been given to African theological library development since then. It has been a regular item of interest within the Association of Christian Librarians and the American Theological Library Association, and it is a very large part of the library development work of the Theological Book Network (TBN). TBN has shipped several hundred thousand titles to African theological libraries over the past decade.²³ But institutional growth drives a demand for resources that far outpaces supply.

Internet access has developed slowly across sub-Saharan Africa. Most theological institutions now have connections, but service can be slow, many places experience power outages, and wi-fi is slowly coming into play. Western research databases for finding journal articles and e-books, such as JStor and Ebsco, are available at highly discounted rates or for free, but in many settings, limited bandwidth makes for slow going and local network servers are not powerful enough to run the databases well.

Catholics in Africa have some of the best institutions and networks for theologizing. Their evaluators speak of a too-rapid expansion of seminaries in order to keep up with the pastoral needs of the church, and of the continuing need to call on missionary educators because of the shortage of African theologians.²⁴ Yet the enterprise rests on strong institutional pillars. These include the Catholic Faculties of Kinshasa, which owe their inheritance to the University of Lovanium, founded in Kinshasa in 1954 with the assistance of the University in Louvain, Belgium. Consider also the Catholic Institute of West Africa, in Abidjan, Ivory Coast, a post-graduate research center (f. 1975) with the nation's best library. A third force is the Catholic University of Central Africa (f. 1991), with campuses in Yaoundé and Douala, Cameroon; Pointe-Noire in Congo Brazzaville; and planned campuses in Libreville, Gabon and Bangui, CAR. Add to this what is one of the best Christian universities in Anglophone Africa, the Catholic University of East Africa (f. 1984), in Karen, a leafy suburb of Nairobi.

The main theme that runs across recent reviews of African theological teaching and curriculum has been relevance, in the broadest sense of the term.²⁵ Syllabi, textbooks, instructors and their education often bear the marks of Euro-American contexts, even while the number and percentage of expatriate instructors in Africa continue to decline. In theology itself, the quest for authentically African modes of thought and action has continued for two or three generations now.²⁶ This is a deep and fascinating subject, but suffice it to say here that it has been hindered in its development by the structural weaknesses of higher education and intellectual discourse more generally.²⁷ Indeed, these conversations seem to have lost some traction in recent years.²⁸ Those who have the advanced education and critical skills to work out new patterns of theological thinking and learning seldom have the time or space to do it. The harvest is plentiful and the laborers are few in African Christianity, so the most talented academics often have several church-appointed leadership tasks and are called on to be administrators too. Their theological writing suffers.

Even so, the African theological education scene looks quite different now than it did 20 years ago. One huge change was the opening up, after the end of apartheid, of South African university faculties of theology to increasing numbers of students from other nations. The faculties at the University of KwaZulu Natal and Stellenbosch especially have welcomed international postgraduate theology students, but the great engine on this track is the University of South Africa (UNISA), the massive distance university whose theology faculty has well over 100 members, making it one of the largest in the world. Catholic theological institutes and Catholic university theology faculties also have made major strides in capacity and scholarly productivity over the past quarter-century. Programs for advanced degrees proliferate as stronger regional institutions in many countries aim to serve the ever-growing need for highly educated faculty members and urban pastors. There are now 108 African theological schools or programs in theology that offer master's degrees, and 36 that offer doctoral degrees. Compared to the U.S. and Canada, which have 270 accredited postgraduate schools or university programs to serve a third as many Christians, African theological education is still very thinly spread. Even so, it has come a long way in a very short time.²⁹

Out of Turbulent Trends, New Christian Universities

A surprising new factor has emerged in African Christian higher education over the past three decades: the founding of more than 60 new Christian universities.³⁰ Africa is one of the innovative hotspots in a worldwide trend. According to our worldwide survey done about a decade ago, 178 new Christian universities had been founded since 1980.³¹ Most of these, Catholic and Protestant, include faculties of theology, but they offer a more comprehensive array of degrees as well. At least a dozen of them are built on the foundations of older theological schools. Two prominent examples are St. Paul's University in Kenya, built out from St. Paul's Theological College, a century-old ecumenical Protestant seminary; and Uganda Christian University, built upon the old Bishop Tucker Theological College. These more comprehensive Christian universities are worrisome to veteran theological educators, who fear secularization because of the preponderance of non-theological courses.³² Others point more cynically to the desire of bishops and presbyters to milk these institutions for church income. Yet both of these new universities now have several thousand tuition-paying students, which has made their faculties of theology much more sustainable. St. Paul's faculty of theology enrolls only 300 of the university's 4,000 students, but that is twice as many divinity students as it enrolled in the old days as a theological college.³³ Another critically important result of this move from seminary to university has been the development of advanced programs in theology, including for the Ph.D. degree.³⁴

In order to understand this eruption of new Christian universities, we need to understand what became of the African state university movement. African state universities are emerging from a turbulent half-century. As we have seen, the immediate post-colonial era brought high hopes with supportive governments and massive international investments. But by the 1980s, African universities were suffering deep financial cuts as falling commodity prices and inflated energy prices crippled national budgets. World Bank and IMF advisors pushed debtor nations to reallocate educational spending toward primary and secondary schools.

Meanwhile, authoritarian regimes suspected flagship universities of subversion and slashed their budgets. By the 1990s even the finest African universities were in crisis.³⁵

To compound these problems, the growth of secondary education has driven a relentless demand for tertiary enrollments. Governments pushed their flagship universities to enroll far beyond their carrying capacities.³⁶ New regional universities were founded and technical colleges were granted university status. Nigeria, for example, had founded 86 federal and state universities by 2015.³⁷ Even with increases in funding, African higher education budgets lagged behind enrolment gains. Thousands of African academics left these distressed environs to find work elsewhere.³⁸

So what was to be done? In 2001 the World Bank reaffirmed universities' role in national development. After years of neglect, Western foreign aid programs re-targeted African higher education. Private funders returned; one "Partnership in Higher Education" which engaged eight American foundations with universities in nine African countries invested \$440 million between 2000 and 2010.³⁹ And with measures widely thought to be a neo-liberal coup, African governments began to charge tuitions, focus resources on business and STEM fields, and charter more private universities and technical colleges.⁴⁰

Christian higher education has played a salient role in this rapid growth of private institutions. Nigeria has chartered 61 private institutions since 1999. Of these, 31 are Christian. In Kenya by 2014 there were 17 chartered private universities and 13 more with interim authority. Of all these, 17 were Christian. This trend is quite dynamic across the continent.⁴¹

From a broad social and educational viewpoint, then, the Christian university movement seems to be driven by the same trends that affect all of African higher education: the massive demand for access to higher education, the digital technology revolution and globalization of markets, and the liberalization of government controls and ownership. The religious scene in Africa, however, provides its own drivers for this movement. It is, first, part of a larger effort to institutionalize and conserve the huge waves of Christian adherence that have swept sub-Saharan Africa, and then, to advance a larger mission to the nations. Christian groups in Africa often look first to the educational needs of their children, and they also move quickly to train clergy. But thereafter, as Christian movements become strong national institutions, their educational aims broaden to engage larger social responsibilities.⁴² Universities are a better vehicle than seminaries for pursuing these broader purposes, and across the continent, dozens of new Christian universities have seminary or Bible college ancestry.

Church people started these universities to a large extent so that their own youth might flourish, but the institutions also aim to build up the nation. Consider, for example, the Christian Bilingual University in Beni, a city in war-torn eastern region of the Democratic Republic of the Congo. As the university commenced its academic year in 2008, vice-chancellor David Kasali proclaimed that "the government, the Church and the whole nation are now faced with enormous challenges to rebuild this nation after years of war, poverty and neglect.... The time has come for the people of God to rise up and be agents of a life-giving transformation."⁴³

The Perils of Privatization

These new Christian universities, expressing noble aims and enrolling thousands of eager students, face a variety of challenges. The first comes from the proverbial elephant in the room, the government. African governments gave relatively slight attention to seminaries and Bible schools, but state ministries of education, after liberalizing the chartering of private universities, have been scrambling to establish basic standards and to align the new campuses with national aims and purposes.⁴⁴ From the state's perspective, these new private universities exist to provide broader access, so their chartering often comes with mandates and timelines for steep enrollment increases and rapid institutional development. Bowen University, a Baptist founded institution in Southern Nigeria, opened with 500 students in 2002 and now enrolls 5,000. Covenant University, founded in 2002 by the Nigerian Pentecostal megachurch, Winner's Chapel, now has 15,000 students. Uganda Christian University, an Anglican institution founded in 1997, now has more than 10,000 students. Officials cite rapid growth as both a blessing and a challenge; added tuitions help their budgets but rapid growth strains their ability to recruit instructors, add facilities, and engage in thoughtful and distinctively Christian faculty and curricular development.⁴⁵

The new African Christian universities also reflect some of the traits that mark the "privatizing" trends of higher education more generally, especially the pressure to narrow educational aims to job training and national economic development.⁴⁶ The most fully developed curricular areas, and presumably, those most heavily enrolled in many of these new Christian universities, are the commercial and technical fields, such as management, accountancy and computer science. Indeed, nearly all of the new African Christian universities offer these fields, but few offer a fully comprehensive array of programs across the arts, sciences, social sciences and humanities. They show other signs of fairly shallow development as well, such as very little evidence of a research emphasis. New Christian universities, like new secular privates, tend to be rather top-down and authoritarian in governance and rely quite heavily on part-time instruction. Frequently their libraries and laboratories are scantily equipped.⁴⁷ To be fair, however, these relatively new campuses often have facilities that are superior to those in the state universities. It is quite likely that these newly founded universities may have begun by picking the "low hanging fruit" in higher education, the popular commercial and low-end technical courses, while still planning to take on a broader traditional array of course offerings.

Indeed, these trends may not remain long-term. A recent study of curricular offerings in 44 new African Christian universities found that 39 of them provide a major in business, management, or commerce. More than half of them (25) also provide concentrations in information technology or computer science. So in these respects, they track closely with the trends in privatization. But many of these institutions also focus on what are traditionally known as "the helping professions." A dozen of them offer teacher education degrees, ten offer degree-level training in the health sciences or nursing, ten more offer degrees in agriculture and nine offer law degrees. Another 21 of these African Christian universities provide majors in

theology. More surprisingly, more than half of them (23) have some sort of science major, and 17 have arts, social science or humanities majors beyond theology.⁴⁸

One might hope that some of the other privatizing traits have only a temporary life as well. A study of Christian universities in Kenya found that while most of the recently founded ones rely heavily on part-time instructors, many of them moonlighting from the state university posts, the situation at the more mature Christian higher education institutions has changed. At Daystar University and the Catholic University of Eastern Africa, the percentages of full-time professors have been higher than at the state universities.⁴⁹

Other challenges stem from Christian educational mandates. These institutions announce Christian purposes and perspectives for learning non-religious subjects and they structure campus life to reflect Christian norms. Yet most of them welcome qualified students regardless of faith. These non-Christian students might chafe at taking courses in religion and having religious orientations infused into what most of society sees as non-religious subjects. Some no doubt are frustrated by chapel or behavior codes. Part-time professors, so common to African universities generally, don't see why their teaching might need to be different in a Christian context. State officials have decided to accommodate religious educational partners, but wonder why hiring criteria, curricular development or student norms need to be different on Christian campuses.⁵⁰

So while the idealism, courage and energy of these new Christian communities is heartening, they face the tremendous pressures in higher education to reduce university learning to gaining skills for a station in the workplace. In the developing countries of Africa, where funds are scarce and the need for knowledgeable workers is great, governments relentlessly push for science, business and technology education over all else.⁵¹ And the Christians, for their part, consider it a matter of social justice for them to equip people to prosper.

Making Higher Education Christian

The Bible's vision of prospering, however, includes far more than commercial work and the creation of wealth. And the older and broader models of university education convey the Christian vision of peace, justice, and the full flourishing of people and places more ably than do the new models of market driven higher education. So the leaders of African Christian higher education have to ask: what is it that makes higher education Christian? How do Christian universities advance the gospel's transformation of culture? With all the pressures that exist in the world today to reduce, commodify and instrumentalize higher education, how can these vulnerable new campuses nurture a flowering of Christian thought and culture?

As I said at the start, I have learned from some profound scholars about Christianity's role in the life of the mind,⁵² but among them, only one, Prof. Andrew Walls, devotes much attention to the Majority World. Walls is eager to see the burgeoning Christian movements of the global South and East make greater progress in what he calls the process of cultural

conversion, of working the Gospel down deep into the roots of cultural identity. He identifies this work as a long-term and deeply scholarly task, and calls Christian scholars in every part of the world to interact with "the thought processes of a whole civilization."⁵³ While Walls lays this task first at the feet of theologians, he recognizes the need for Christian insights from every realm of study.⁵⁴ But the reality, we have seen, is that Christian scholarship in Africa still resides mostly within theology and religion studies, and the new Christian universities, while showing a lively concern for Christian living and Christian witness, have not done much yet to incarnate this vision into their academic work. Very little original scholarship of any kind happens in them yet, much less inquiry driven by Christian perspectives, purposes or practice. And African Christian educators face tremendous pressure to shape their priorities and structures according to narrowly instrumental values and aims. So what, realistically, might Christian scholars hope to see happening in these new universities?

Professor Walls poses the idea, for starters, of developing small and disciplined communities of Christian scholarship, outposts rather than comprehensive agencies. He speaks of the Indian tradition of the ashram, "a community of people living a simple life of worship and study together." He alludes to some outstanding examples he knows already at work in the global South and East, for example, the Akrofi-Christaller Institute in Ghana. But he adds that "the Christian ashram could arise in a preexisting institution." The idea is to refocus the Christian scholarly life to a more disciplined, collegial, and pioneering spirit, not dependent on large institutional frames or big money, and free to pursue its dual orientation, toward biblical and Christian thinking, and toward the local culture. What Walls envisages, he has said, is not unlike the monasteries of early Europe.⁵⁵

Cultivating communities of Christian thinking has to start somewhere, but I do not want to give up on the vision of a Christian university, and what can be done, in two dozen fields at once, at a comprehensive institution of learning. I hope for and work for universities that are, as one of Prof. Walls' favorite theologians, Origen of Alexandria, taught, devoted to bringing every realm of knowledge to Christ, the Logos.⁵⁶ That is the vision still at Calvin College, and it is the dream of many a new university, serving under much more adverse conditions. Enacting such a mission, as Gerald Pillay puts it, needs to be rather subversive, because today, universities are being dominated by pecuniary values and a managerial mood. Christian universities, by contrast, are called to restore wholeness by nurturing fully orbed communities of scholarship and learning.⁵⁷ Whether they exist in Lagos or Liverpool or Grand Rapids, Christian universities must swim against the main political and economic currents. But, says Prof. Walls, that is the most promising and productive context for original scholarship--in mission, outside the halls of power, living, thinking and teaching in a vulnerable position, on someone else's turf and terms.⁵⁸

Are there any signs that Christian scholarship in theology and beyond is perking up in Africa? Where is it located, and are the new Christian universities playing any role in it? As we have mentioned above, theology per se has had its ups and downs across the continent, with only South Africa being able to sustain a discourse with much continuity. But I have been privileged to witness new signs of vitality, resourcefulness and focused talent. For the past four

years, the Nagel Institute has operated continent-wide research grants programs for African scholars in theology and the social sciences, developing in effect a new, pan-African network of interdisciplinary Christian scholarship. With funding from two different Templeton foundations, we have made grants to 39 different research teams, ranging from Senegal to Tanzania, from Cape Town to Addis Ababa, and into the Congo as well. The aim of these projects is to better understand how the gospel might engage today's African realities in four areas: African values and spirituality, health and healing, religious innovation and competition, and forgiveness and reconciliation. The aim is to see an empirically grounded theology emerge, or perhaps a theologically animated empiricism, and so a new Christian scholarship for a rapidly changing Africa. We have been amazed at the productivity and the new discoveries of these African research teams.⁵⁹

But how does this relate to Christian higher education? Where are these scholars situated? As you might expect, many of the grantees are situated in university faculties of theology or religious studies. Few are in free-standing theological seminaries. But how about the new Christian universities? I am encouraged to say that two of the more developed Christian universities, Daystar and the Catholic University of East Africa, have grant winning teams. And one remarkable team comes from the tiny Shalom University in Bunia, that deeply distressed city in the northeast of the Democratic Republic of Congo. Probably there most dramatically we see the kind of Christian creativity Professor Walls hopes for: it comes from outside the halls of power, living, thinking and teaching from a vulnerable position.

So yes, I am hopeful about the flourishing of Christian scholarship in Africa, and indeed for the new Christian universities of Africa. In spite of the daunting systemic problems and globalizing pressures they face, it is difficult to believe that in God's providence and with such great human ingenuity and daring, so many of them would have sprung up only to be turned in secular and narrowly instrumental directions. African history is full of surprises, and so is God.

Response

Dr. Andrew F. Walls

June 28, 2019

We have heard a magisterial lecture on a topic vital to the good estate of Christ's Church militant here on earth. It deserves a better response than I can give; but any response must begin with one of the opening passages of the lecture. We all join in gratitude for the life, work and ministry of Lamin Sanneh, and our sense of loss in that one so central to the origins and life of this Group and all that it stands for has been taken from us. Lamin was not only a scholar of the first rank; he was one of those few scholars who change the way people think about topics of great moment. While meticulous with detail, he dealt with the biggest and deepest issues of life and society, bringing illumination to them. A strategic thinker, he opened new pathways for collaborative activity. Sincere in faith and generous in humanity, he was a dear friend who invariably made good things better. His legacy will endure, and we are all his beneficiaries.

On the body of Dr. Carpenter's lecture, on which there is so much to ponder, I venture three principal observations. In the first place I would underline Dr. Carpenter's identification of the primacy of the missionary contribution to higher education in Africa over the factors of colonial or governmental policy. In the 1860s, Henry Venn, Secretary of the Church Missionary Society, after analysing census figures, pointed out that Sierra Leone had at that time a higher literacy rate than England or Prussia, and a higher proportion of the population in education. This, he said, was not the result of colonial government policy – indeed, he argued, the colonial government were not making use of educated Africans as they should – but to the activity of the Anglican and Methodist missions.

Fourah Bay College – founded in 1827, but with roots going back to 1814 - was the crown of an integrated educational system designed by the missions for the whole Sierra Leone Colony. There was a hierarchy of elementary schools and grammar (that is High), Schools for boys and girls, teaching the whole curriculum that their English models did. (An initial decision that Latin was not necessary in African grammar schools was overturned at the insistence of Sierra Leoneans, who urged that as Latin was judged essential to the English grammar school curriculum, it should be so in Africa as well). The origin of this conviction lies in the close association of the early 19th century missionary enterprise in Africa with the campaign against slavery; and in the contemporary evangelical theology that emphasised human solidarity both in nature and in grace, loved such texts as “God has made of one blood all nations of men” and insisted that the highest human attainments whether by nature by grace were open to Africans. The measure of what constituted high attainment was of course one formed by Western intellectual and literary history; that there could be other measures was a discovery yet to be made by Western missions. Nevertheless, these convictions ensured that Fourah Bay College in Sierra Leone was tropical Africa's first institution of higher education, and by the 1870s was offering degree programmes in Arts and Divinity.

Even so, mission support for Fourah Bay College was not consistent, but fluctuating. By 1840, the college was decaying; it was revitalized when assessments of the 1841 Niger Expedition opened the vision of Sierra Leone as both the nursery for missionaries to evangelize the interior of the Continent and as the language laboratory for that task. The result was the creation of the academic discipline of comparative African linguistics in the mid-19th century by an eccentric German missionary who had been appointed to Fourah Bay College to teach Hebrew and Arabic there.

It was not to be the last time that an African institution pioneered a new academic field. Dr. Carpenter points to the presence all over Anglophone Africa of universities with Departments of Religious Studies. Many of these provide courses in African Traditional Religion, a discipline hard to trace in British universities. The first such course was introduced in the first African Department of Religious Studies, that of the University of Ibadan in Nigeria, around 1947. (Incidentally, Departments of Religious Studies had existed in Nigeria for twenty years before the first such department appeared in Britain).

The educational and literary traditions of 19th century Sierra Leone produced intellectuals such as J. A. B. Horton – the first African to graduate from my own University of Edinburgh - who has his own place in the story of African national movements and who in the nineteenth century was arguing for a full-scale University for West Africa.

World War II brought another period of eclipse for Fourah Bay College - so much so that the post-war Elliot Commission that led to the establishment of the present universities of Ghana (Legon) and Ibadan barely noticed Fourah Bay College. Fortunately, public opinion in Sierra Leone, always proud of their college which had pioneered university education in West Africa, refused to be silenced; and in the 1950s I had the high privilege of cutting my academic teeth as a teacher at Fourah Bay College as it made the transition from a missionary institution to the public university of an independent nation. I may add that at that time almost a quarter of the College's students came from West African countries other than Sierra Leone.

In the parallel, but rather different story in Southern Africa, as again Dr. Carpenter indicates, the importance of the Lovedale institution can hardly be over-estimated. Such Lovedale products as Tiyo Soga were signs and wonders in a society like Cape Colony; when Soga followed up his course there with seven years of Arts and Divinity in Scotland, and returned a fully ordained missionary of his Church, he came as one of the best educated people in the colony, and accordingly a standing source of irritation to white petty officials.

My second observation is to suggest a possible hidden factor in the story, only indirectly of African origin, and outside the sphere of the major missionary vocabulary of some key figures of the African national movement who had not been through the elite mission schools but made their own way to the West. Such figures as Kwame Nkrumah and Nnamdi Azikiwe had their own ideas about the place and nature of the universities they wanted in the new nations they led.

In the early 1960s, those heady days when the new African nations were emerging ("Bliss was it in that dawn to be alive, but to be young was very heaven") I served in the new University of Nigeria that Nnamdi Azikiwe had set up at Nsukka, with himself as hands-on Chancellor. Azikiwe was determined that the British model of university, favoured by the former colonial power, would not monopolize Nigeria's university system: this new institution would draw on models and personnel from all over the world; including on the one hand American universities (he was an admirer of the Land Grant system) with USAID funding and on another the Karl Marx Institute in Leipzig with Warsaw Pact connections. Everything from everywhere would be turned to the service of the new nation of Nigeria.

The faculty in my day included people from 27 different nationalities, Oxbridge products with a classical outlook jostled with African American matrons representing such discourses as Home Economics and Secretarial Studies. The influence of the Black Colleges was manifest. The Department of Religion had both Catholic and Protestant membership (Vatican II was still in session at the time). Gloriously chaotic and chaotically glorious, it was the most stimulating intellectual environment I have ever worked in.

An American Black college also formed the background of one of the seminal figures in African educational history. In British Sunday schools in the 1930s we learned of great Christian figures in other lands. Only one African Christian was named – J. E. K. Aggrey, who had come to faith through an African American mission in what is now Ghana, gaining his education at Livingstone College in North Carolina. We heard of his stirring utterances: “Only the best is good enough for Africa”; “Give us science, and yet more science, but do not give us less Greek”. We heard about his parables, learning that a piano where only the white keys were played offers only a limited musical experience. Above all was his great parable of Africa as an eagle taught to think of itself as a chicken by feeding with chickens.

Aggrey had appeared on the international stage as Africa’s eloquent spokesman on the Phelps Stokes Commissions of the 1920s and 1930s. These commissions probably reflect the first serious foundation money to be devoted to education in Africa. In parentheses we should record that the next such outlay probably came with the setting up of the Theological Education Fund, presided over for a time by the future Archbishop Desmond Tutu, with the goal of improving African theological education to the highest level, which I mention for its special connection with Yale Divinity School. The normative book list intended to be a guide to libraries all over Africa was compiled here by Raymond Morris, one of the predecessors of this lecture’s chairman; and the ambassador of the fund, who covered Africa with good news of the funding to gain access to these treasures, was the late Charles Forman of this School. I heard him present the good news of the Theological Education Fund at Fourah Bay College in 1961.

My third line of commentary involves seizing on one of the examples of development indicated by Dr. Carpenter, and raising doctrines upon it, rather on the lines of a Puritan sermon. The example is the establishment, through the vision of the Ghanaian theologian the late Kwame Bediako and his wife, of what is now known as the Akrofi-Christaller Institute for Theology Mission and Culture, recognized by the Ghana government as a postgraduate university for research in its stated fields. Kwame Bediako’s academic credentials and pastoral experience would have assured him a welcome to the faculty of a university or a seminary: but he saw neither these as sufficiently addressing certain crying needs in Christian provision for his day and nation. These are reflected in the original title of the institution: the Akrofi-Christaller Memorial Centre for Applied Theology and Mission Research.

In other words, a new type of institution was needed which would see theology in relation to the societies, history, languages, and thought processes of Africa, and would engage in research – that is, investigation, discovery, adding to human knowledge. Jim Ault’s film shown here last night captured something of what this new type of institution was about. We saw a university institution with no undergraduate programmes, that was international (and specifically pan-African), ecumenical, based in a worshipping community where the office and kitchen staff lead worship; along with teachers and students; that explores Christian faith in relation both to old and to modern Africa. On the one hand it is a reminder that Christian higher education in Africa may develop vehicles different from those of the West. On another, it may remind us that scholarship was saved for the West in earlier centuries by adopting and adapting

Christian institutions. The origins of the modern secular university lie in Christian monasticism. Though decently veiled in Latin, the motto of the University of Oxford is still “The Lord is my Light.”

To underline the importance of the theme that Dr. Carpenter has brought to us, and to celebrate the cheering message of his closing section, I return to the inspirational figure of J. E. K. Aggrey. In our time Africa has become one of the world’s major theatres of Christian activity, the stage on which much of life and thought of 21st century Christianity will be acted out. And in World Christianity we all belong together. The intellectual life and theological health of twenty-first century World Christianity requires the African eagle to soar into flight, borne by the wind of the Holy Spirit. Chicken feed is no diet for eagles. In intellectual and theological and institutional terms, as Aggrey knew, Only the best is good enough for Africa.

NOTES

¹ See, for example, Joel Carpenter, "Religion in American Academic Life," *Religion and American Culture* 8 (Summer 1998): 265-281; Carpenter, "Sustaining Christian Intellectual Commitments: Lessons from the Recent Past," in *The Future of Christian Higher Education*, ed. David S. Dockery and David P. Gushee (Nashville: Broadman & Holman, 1999), 105-120; Carpenter, "The Perils of Prosperity: Neo-Calvinism and the Future of Religious Colleges," in *The Future of Religious Colleges*, ed. Paul Dove (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2002), 185-207.

² Joel Carpenter, Perry L. Glanzer, and Nicholas Lantinga, eds., *Christian Higher Education: A Global Reconnaissance* (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2014).

³ Thomas C. Oden, *How Africa Shaped the Christian Mind: Rediscovering the African Seedbed of Western Christianity* (Downers Grove, Ill.: InterVarsity Press, 2007).

⁴ Paul T. Zeleza "A Historical Accounting of African Universities: Beyond Afropessimism," *African Higher Education Research Online*, 17 July 2006. Accessed on 18 June 2019. http://ahero.uwc.ac.za/index.php?module=cshe&action=viewtitle&id=cshe1_11

⁵ Daniel J. Paracka, Jr., *The Athens of West Africa: A History of International Education at Fourah Bay College, Freetown, Sierra Leone* (Routledge, 2004); Russell W. Irvine, *The African American Quest for Institutions of Higher Education before the Civil War: The Forgotten Histories of the Ashmun Institute, Liberia College, and Avery College* (Lewiston, NY: Edwin Mellen, 2010); William Ritchie, et al., *The History of the South African College, 1829–1918* (Cape Town: Maskew Miller, 1918); Maurice Boucher, *The University of the Cape of Good Hope and the University of South Africa, 1873-1946: A Study in National and Imperial Perspective*, Archives Yearbook, 35th year, 1972, 1 (Pretoria: Government Printer, 1974). For a helpful overview of the early years of modern African universities, see G.-M. Lulat, *A History of African Higher Education from Antiquity to the Present: A Critical Synthesis* (Westport, Conn.: Praeger Publishers, 2005), 261-330.

⁶ See, e.g., Thomas W. Livingston, "The Exportation of American Higher Education to West Africa: Liberia College, 1850-1900," *The Journal of Negro Education* 45:3 (Summer 1976): 246-262, which argues that Liberia College was an extension of the movement to found church-related colleges in the early United States.

⁷ See, e.g., Paracka, *The Athens of West Africa*, 258.

⁸ J.F. Ade Ajayi, Lameck K.H. Goma, and G. Ampah Johnson, *The African Experience with Higher Education* (Athens, Ohio: Ohio University Press, 1996), 28-60.

⁹ Bronwyn Louise Strydom, "'To Buttress the Ideal of National Unity': Broad South Africanism and Higher Education in the Early Twentieth Century," *South African Historical Journal* 68:2 (2016): 163-179.

¹⁰ Graham A. Duncan, *Lovedale--Coercive Agency: Power and Resistance in Mission Education* (Pietermaritzburg, SA, Cluster Books, 2004); Pamela Johnson, "Procrastination and

Perseverance: Colonial Ambiguity and African Aspirations in the Origins of Fort Hare University,” *South African Journal of Cultural History* 32:1 (July 2018): 65-84.

¹¹ Nelson Mandela, *Long Walk to Freedom* (Boston: Little Brown, 1994), 43.

¹² Daniel Massey, *Under Protest: The Rise of Student Resistance at the University of Fort Hare* (Pretoria; UNISA Press, 2010).

¹³ Joel Samoff and Bidemi Carrol, “The Promise of Partnership and Continuities of Dependence: External Support to Higher Education in Africa,” *African Studies Review* 47:1 (April 2004): 77-89; Damtew Teferra, “The Shifting Landscape of Development Cooperation: Repercussions for African Higher Education,” *Journal of Higher Education in Africa* 12:2 (2014), 3-5.

¹⁴ For years 1900, 1970 and 2019, see Gina A. Zurlo, Todd M. Johnson, and Peter F. Crossing, “Christianity 2019: What’s Missing?” *International Bulletin of Mission Research* 43:1 (January 2019): 97. The 1950 estimate comes from Todd M. Johnson, Gina A. Zurlo, Albert W. Hickman, and Peter F. Crossing, “Christianity 2016: Latin America and Projecting Religions to 2050,” *International Bulletin of Mission Research* 40:1 (January 2016): 26.

¹⁵ Dyron Daugherty, “Bishop Stephen Neill, the IMC and the State of African Theological Education in 1950,” *Studies in World Christianity* 18.1 (2012): 41-62.

¹⁶ Paul Bowers, “New Light on African Theological Education,” *Evangelical Review of Theology* 14.1 (1990) 57-63.

¹⁷ Global Directory of Theological Education Institutions, accessed at <http://www.globethics.net/web/gtl/directory/> on 3 June 2019.

¹⁸ Cephas N. Omenyo, “‘The Spirit-Filled Goes to School’: Theological Education in African Pentecostalism,” *Ogbomoso Journal of Theology* 13:2 (2008): 41-55; Thomas Oduro, “Theological Education in the African Independent Churches: A Plethora of Pedagogies,” in the *Handbook of Theological Education in Africa*, ed. Isabel Apawo Phiri and Dietrich Werner (Oxford: Regnum Books, 2013), 423-432.

¹⁹ “Brief History,” http://www.ug.edu.gh/religions/about/brief_history accessed 13 June 2019.

²⁰ Omenyo, “The Spirit-Filled Goes to School,” 50-51.

²¹ Tharcisse Gatwa, “Theological Education in Francophone Africa,” in *Handbook of Theological Education in Africa*, 177.

²² Bowers, “New Light.”

²³ Georgianne Bordner, “CILA Update: ACL Conference Program, June 12, 2007,” *The Christian Librarian* 50:3 (2007): 119-121; Harry D. Sandy Ayer and Melody Layton McMahon, “World Christianity Interest Group: Connecting and Collaborating with Theological Libraries Overseas,” *ATLA Summary of Proceedings* 68 (2014):219-223; Ephraim Mudave, “Bridging the Gap: The

Role of Libraries and Archives in Mission Studies in East Africa,” in *Mission, Memory and Communion: Documenting World Christianity in the Twenty-First Century* (Singapore: Trinity Theological College, 2013), 156-162; “Network Milestone -- 2 Million Books Sent!” *Theological Book Network Newsletter*, May 2016. <http://www.theologicalbooknetwork.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/05/NewsletterMay2016.pdf> Accessed 18 August 2016.

²⁴ See, e.g., Gosbert Byamungu, “Unleashing Theological Energy for Africa and the World Church—Roman Catholic Perspectives on African Theological Education,” in *Handbook of Theological Education in Africa*, ed. Isabel Apawo Phiri and Dietrich Werner (Oxford: Regnum Books, 2013), 301-306; and Paul Bere, “Theological Formation in the Roman Catholic Church in Africa,” in *Handbook of Theological Education in Africa*, 307-315.

²⁵ See, e.g., Isabel Apawo Phiri and Dietrich Werner, “Editorial: Handbook of Theological Education in Africa,” in *Handbook of Theological Education in Africa*, xxviii-xxix.

²⁶ See a very valuable if now dated survey: Tinyiko Sam Maluleke, “Half a Century of African Christian Theologies: Elements of the Emerging Agenda for the Twenty-first Century,” *Journal of Theology for Southern Africa* 99 (1997): 5-6. An impressive synthesis of contemporary African theology, particularly of work in the inculturation mode, is Matthew Michael, *Christian Theology and African Traditions* (Cambridge, UK: Lutterworth Press, 2013).

²⁷ For a more sustained survey of this topic, see Joel A. Carpenter and Nellie Kooistra, *Engaging Africa: Prospects for Project Funding in Selected Fields* (Grand Rapids: Calvin College, 2014), 47-56, 84-93.

²⁸ Mokgethi Motlhaki, “Phases of Black Theology in South Africa: A Historical Review,” *Religion & Theology* 16 (2009): 162-180. The author adds that in a South African context, the transformation of university faculties of theology into broader religious studies programs has tended to deflate theological discourse.

²⁹ African institutions with post-grad theology programs: Global Directory of Theological Education Institutions, <http://www.globethics.net/web/gtl/directory/> accessed 13 June 2019. ATS institutions: <https://www.ats.edu/about> accessed 13 June 2019.

³⁰ Joel Carpenter, “New Christian Universities and the Conversion of Cultures,” *Evangelical Review of Theology* 36:1 (January 2012): 21. Perhaps this development is not so much new as coming full circle, back to the Christian origins of African university education, as in Fourah Bay and Liberia Colleges.

³¹ Perry L. Glanzer, Joel A. Carpenter and Nick Lantinga, “Looking for God in Higher Education: Examining Trends in Global Christian Higher Education,” *Higher Education* 61:6 (2011): 721-755.

³² To find this perspective and others among leaders of Kenyan Christian universities, see John R. Bonnell, “Changing Landscapes in Kenyan Higher Education: An Analysis of the Impact of Shifting Contexts upon Religious-oriented Universities,” Ph.D. dissertation, Michigan State University, 2015.

³³ Faith W. Nguru, "Development of Christian Higher Education in Kenya: An Overview," in *Christian Higher Education: A Global Reconnaissance*, ed. Joel Carpenter, Perry L. Glanzer and Nicholas S. Lantinga (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2014), 55-56.

³⁴ See, e.g., Esther Mombo and John Chesworth, "From St. Paul's Divinity School to St. Paul's University – A Story of Theological Education from Kenya," *Handbook of Theological Education in Africa*, 893-901.

³⁵ Demtew Teferra and Philip G. Altbach, "African Higher Education: Challenges for the 21st Century," *Higher Education* 47:1 (January 2004): 21-50; Akilagpa Sawyerr, "Challenges Facing African Universities: Selected Issues," *African Studies Review* 47:1 (April 2004): 1-59.

³⁶ Goolam Mohamedbhai, "Massification in Higher Education Institutions in Africa: Causes, Consequences, and Responses," *International Journal of African Higher Education* 1:1 (2014): 59-83.

³⁷ Musa A. B. Gaiya, "Higher Christian Universities in Sub-Saharan Africa: Prospects and Challenges," 1-3, paper presented at the Eighth International Conference of the International Association for the Promotion of Christian Higher Education, Baeksook University, Cheonan City, South Korea, May 30 – June 3, 2016. Accessed at [http://iapche.org/media/files/default/Gaiya%2C Musa A. B. - Full Paper.pdf](http://iapche.org/media/files/default/Gaiya%2C%20Musa%20A.%20B.%20-%20Full%20Paper.pdf) on 23 August 2016.

³⁸ Soumana Sako, "Brain Drain and Africa's Development: A Reflection," *African Issues* 30:1 (2002): 25-30; Jack Mangala, ed. *Africa and its Global Diaspora: The Policy and Politics of Emigration* (Cham, Switz.: Palgrave Macmillan, 2017).

³⁹ *Lessons from a Ten-Year Funder Collaborative: A Case Study of the Partnership for Higher Education in Africa* (New York: Clear Thinking Communications, 2010), 5-6.

⁴⁰ Mahlubi Mabizela, Daniel C. Levy, and Wycliff Otieno, eds. "Private Surge amid Public Dominance Dynamics of the Private Provision of Higher Education in Africa," special issue, *Journal of Higher Education in Africa* 5:2-3 (2007); Tade Akin Aina, "Beyond Reforms: The Politics of Higher Education Transformation in Africa," *African Studies Review* 53:1 (April 2010): 21-40; Touorouzou Herve Some, "In Search of Sources other than Governmental in the Financing of Higher Education in Sub-Saharan Africa: A Word of Caution Beyond the Gains," *Journal of Higher Education in Africa* 8:1 (2010): 73-98.

⁴¹ Joel Carpenter, "Christian Universities Grow in Africa," *International Higher Education* no. 88 (Winter 2017): 25.

⁴² Joel Carpenter, "New Evangelical Universities: Cogs in a World System or Players in a New Game?" in *Interpreting Contemporary Christianity: Global Processes and Local Identities*, ed. Ogbu Kalu and Alaine Low (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2008), 151-186.

⁴³ David Kasali, *Congo Initiative – Université Chrétienne Bilingue du Congo (CI -UCBC) Annual Report* (2007-8), p.3. Found at http://www.congoinitiative.org/view.cfm?page_id=48 Accessed 22 March 2014. But see Fatai Ayinde Aremu, “Faith-Based Universities in Nigeria and the Consequences for Citizenship,” *Africa Today* 62:1 (Fall 2015): 3-28, which finds that faith-based universities in Nigeria did less well than their public secular university counterparts in promoting citizenship.

⁴⁴Linda Tsevi, “Quality Assurance in Private Higher Education: The Case of Ghana,” PROPHE Working Paper Series WP No. 20 November 2015. Accessed at <https://prophe.org/en/working-papers/quality-assurance-in-private-higher-education-the-case-of-ghana/> on 24 June 2019; Ishmael I. Munene, “‘University is ISO 9000:2008 Certified’: Neoliberal Echoes, Knowledge Production and Quality Assurance in Kenyan State Universities,” *Journal of Higher Education in Africa* 11:1-2 (2013): 161-182.

⁴⁵ Nguru, “Development of Christian Higher Education in Kenya,” 62-64; Medard Rugyendo, “Strategies for Faith Engagement Within One’s Career: The Role of Uganda Christian University in Preparing Students for Postgraduation Life,” *Christian Higher Education* 14:1 (2015): 3, 8-9.

⁴⁶Philip G. Altbach and Liz Reisberg, “Global Trends and Future Uncertainties,” *Change* 50:3-4 (2018): 63-67. To view these effects at work in an African setting, see Milton O. Obamba, “Myth and Ceremony: Contested Marketization and Internationalization Regimes in Kenya's Higher Education,” *Journal of Higher Education in Africa* 7:3 (2009): 125-149.

⁴⁷E.g., Nguru, “Development of Christian Higher Education in Kenya,” 59-65.

⁴⁸ Perry L. Glanzer, “Dispersing the Light: The Status of Christian Higher Education around the Globe,” *Christian Scholars Review* 42:4 (Summer 2013): 336-337.

⁴⁹ Wycliffe Otieno and Daniel Levy, “Public Disorder, Private Boom? Inter-sectoral Dynamics Illustrated by the Kenyan Case,” p. 4. PROPHE Working Paper #9, Program for Research in Private Higher Education, University at Albany, State University of New York, July 2007.

⁵⁰ Nguru, 58, 62; Musa A. B. Gaiya, “Revolution in Higher Education in Nigeria: The Emergence of Private Universities,” in *Christian Higher Education: A Global Reconnaissance*, 39-40; Rugyendo, “The Role of Uganda Christian University,” 5-7; Leah Marangu, “Christian Universities and the Government,” paper presented at Overseas Council Institute for Excellence: “Emerging Christian Universities in Africa.” Athi River, Kenya, 8 May 2012.

⁵¹In some respects, South Africa epitomizes the trend: see Christine Winberg, “Undisciplining Knowledge Production: Development Driven Higher Education in South Africa,” *Higher Education* 51:2 (March 2006): 159-172; Meenal Shrivastava and Sanjiv Shrivastava, “Political Economy of Higher Education: Comparing South Africa to Trends in the World,” *Higher Education* 67:6 (June 2014): 809-822.

⁵² Some representative works in this field that I particularly appreciate: George M. Marsden, *The Outrageous Idea of Christian Scholarship* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1997); Robert Benne, *Quality with Soul: How Six Premier Colleges and Universities Keep Faith with Their*

Religious Traditions (Grand Rapids; Eerdmans, 2001); Nicholas Wolterstorff, *Educating for Shalom: Essays on Christian Higher Education* (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2004); and Mark A. Noll, *Jesus Christ and the Life of the Mind* (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2011).

⁵³ Andrew F. Walls, "Christian Scholarship and the Demographic Transformation of the Church," in *Theological Literacy for the Twenty-first Century*, ed. Rodney L. Petersen, with Nancy M. Rourke (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2002), 172.

⁵⁴ Walls, "Christian Scholarship," 166.

⁵⁵ Andrew Walls, "Of Ivory Towers and Ashrams: Some Reflections on Theological Scholarship in Africa," *Journal of African Christian Thought* 3:1 (June 2000): 1-4.

⁵⁶ Andrew Walls, *Crossing Cultural Frontiers: Studies in the History of World Christianity* (Maryknoll, NY: Orbis, 2017), 27-30.

⁵⁷ Gerald Pillay, "Education as Mission: Perspectives on Some New Opportunities," in *Mission in the 21st Century: Exploring the Five Marks of Global Mission*, ed. Andrew Walls and Cathy Ross (Maryknoll, N.Y.: Orbis Books, 2008), 172.

⁵⁸ Walls, "Christian Scholarship," 170.

⁵⁹ Publications from the 23 projects from 2015-2017 now number 80 and are increasing. We expect a similar output from the 16 current projects. For some results of the first cohort of research teams, see two dedicated journal issues: *Journal of Contemporary African Studies* 36:3 (2018); and *International Bulletin of Mission Research* 41:4 (October 2017).